

# Looking for evidence

| I<br>Character trait | Evidence from historical quotes   |                                  | Evidence from briefing sheet         |                                  |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
|                      | II<br>Initial supporting evidence | III<br>Possible counter-evidence | IV<br>Additional supporting evidence | V<br>Additional counter-evidence |
|                      |                                   |                                  |                                      |                                  |
|                      |                                   |                                  |                                      |                                  |
|                      |                                   |                                  |                                      |                                  |
|                      |                                   |                                  |                                      |                                  |
|                      |                                   |                                  |                                      |                                  |

# CHARACTER ANALYSIS

## 1. PHYSICAL QUALITIES

### A. POSITIVE QUALITIES:

- manly, virile, robust, hardy, sturdy, comely, strong, stalwart, muscular, brawny.
- beautiful, pretty, lovely, fair, good-looking, handsome, dainty, delicate, graceful, elegant, exquisite, charming, shapely, attractive, winsome, fascinating, ravishing.
- neat, spruce, dapper, immaculate, adroit, dexterous, adept, skillful, agile, nimble, active, spirited, vivacious, lively.

### B. NEGATIVE QUALITIES:

- weak, feeble, sickly, frail, decrepit, thin, spare, emaciated, cadaverous.
- effeminate, unmanly, unwomanly, ugly, hideous, homely, coarse, unkempt, slovenly.
- awkward, clumsy, gawky, ungainly, repugnant, graceless, incongruous, ghastly, repulsive, odious, invidious, loathsome, horrible, bizarre, plain.

## 2. MENTAL QUALITIES

### A. POSITIVE QUALITIES:

- educated, erudite, scholarly, learned, wise, astute, genius, sage, intelligent, talented, intellectual, precocious, capable, competent, gifted, apt.
- rational, reasonable, sensible, shrewd, prudent, observant, clever, ingenious, inventive, subtle, broad-minded, cunning, crafty, wily, whimsical, eccentric, talented.

### B. NEGATIVE QUALITIES:

- unintelligent, unschooled, unlettered, ignorant, illiterate, inane, irrational, puerile.
- foolish, fatuous, crass, obtuse, vacuous, bigoted, narrow-minded, ungifted, simple.
- shallow, dull, stupid, thickskulled, crack-brain, idiotic, demented, deranged, witless, unpolished, inarticulate.

### 3. MORAL QUALITIES

#### A. POSITIVE QUALITIES:

- idealistic, innocent, virtuous, faultless, righteous, guileless, unpretentious.
- upright, candid, exemplary, chaste, pure, undefiled, temperate, abstemious.
- austere, puritanical, truthful, honourable, trustworthy, straightforward, decent, respectable.

#### B. NEGATIVE QUALITIES:

- pretentious, wicked, iniquitous, corrupt, degenerate, notorious, vicious, infamous,
- immoral unprincipled, reprobate, depraved, indecent, ribald, vulgar, intemperate, sensual, dissolute, deceitful, dishonest, unscrupulous, dishonourable.
- base, vile, foul, ill-tempered, ill-natured.

### 4. SPIRITUAL QUALITIES

#### A. POSITIVE QUALITIES:

- religious, reverent, pious, devout, faithful, regenerate, holy, saintly, angelic, god-like.

#### B. NEGATIVE QUALITIES:

- skeptical, atheistic, irreligious, impious, irreverent, profane, sacrilegious, blasphemous, unregenerate materialistic, carnal, mundane, godless, diabolic, fiendlike, agnostic.

## Negative comments about Joan

Joan's enemies were predominately from the following groups:

- the English;
- the Burgundians (who were allied with the English);
- churchmen who feared for their lives if they supported Joan or who hoped to gain favour with the English by not supporting her.

The following passages or articles are taken from a document read to Joan on March 27, 1430, formally outlining the 70 crimes she was accused of committing. These articles were prepared by Jean d'Estivet, the prosecutor of the trial. d'Estivet was a friend of Bishop Cauchon, the Inquisitor judge. The very formal, legal nature of the document makes it difficult to read. The best strategy is to read in chunks and try to grasp the main idea, and not get bogged down in trying to understand every word.

### *Promoting witchcraft*

11. "The Accused, not only this year, but from her infancy, and not only in your Diocese [the areas under a bishop's control]...but also in many other places in this kingdom, had done, composed [made up], contrived [plotted] and ordained [ordered] a number of sacrileges [violations of anything sacred to the Church] and superstitions: she made herself a diviner [someone who speaks for God], she caused herself to be adored and venerated [looked upon with respect]; she had invoked [summoned] demons, and evil spirits, consulted them, associated with them, had made and had with them compacts, treaties and conventions, had made use of them, had furnished to others, acting in the same manner, aid, succor [help], and favour, and had, in much, led them on to act like herself; she had said, affirmed, and maintained that to act thus, to use witchcraft, divinations [God-like characteristics], superstitions, was not a sin, was not a forbidden thing, but, on the contrary, a thing lawful, to be praised, worthy of approval; also she had led into these errors and evil doings a very great number of persons of diverse estates, of both sexes, and had imprinted on their hearts, the most fatal errors..." **Article 2**

### *Contradicting divine teachings*

12. "The Accused had fallen into many diverse and detestable [extremely hateful] errors which reek [smell] of heresy [actions that contradict Divine teachings of God]. She had said, vociferated [shouted], uttered, published and inculcated [instilled] within the hearts of the simple, false and lying propositions [statements] allied to heresy, even themselves heretical, contrary to our Catholic Faith and its principles, to Gospel rules, and to the Statutes established or approved by General Councils; propositions, contrary not only to the Divine Law but also to Canon and Civil Law; propositions scandalous, sacrilegious [violating anything sacred], contrary to good manners, offensive to pious [religious] ears; she had furnished help, counsel and favour to the people who dogmatically [firmly believed] affirmed, or promulgated [publicly announced] such propositions." **Article 3**

### *Acting immorally*

13. "Jeanne attributes to God, His Angels and His Saints, orders which are against the modesty of the sex, and which are prohibited [forbidden] by the Divine Law...In one word, putting aside the modesty of her sex, she acted not only against all feminine decency, but even against the reserve which men of good morals, wearing ornaments and garments which only profligate [immoral and reckless] men are accustomed to use, and going so far as to carry arms of offense [to carry weapons]. To attribute all this to the order of God, to the order which had been transmitted [passed on] to her by the Angels and even by Virgin Saints, is to blaspheme [curse or swear in God's name] God and His Saints, to destroy the Divine Law and violate the Canonical Rules; it is to libel [discredit] the sex and its virtue [goodness], to overturn all decency, to justify all examples of dissolute [immoral, sinful] living, and to drive others thereto." **Article 13**

### *Wearing men's clothing*

14. "Previous to, and since her capture, at the Castle of Beaufort and at Arras, Jeanne had been many times advised with gentleness by noble persons of both sexes, to give up her man's dress and resume [wear again] suitable attire [clothing]. She had

absolutely refused, and to this day also refuses with persistence; she disdains [considers it unworthy of her character] also to give herself up to feminine work, conducting herself in all things rather as a man than as a woman." **Article 16**

*Encouraging war and bloodshed*

15. "So long as Jeanne remained with Charles she did dissuade him with all her power, him and those with him, from consenting [agreeing] to any treaty of peace, any arrangement with his adversaries [enemies]; inciting them always to murder and effusion [spread] of blood; affirming that they could only have peace by sword and lance; and that God willed it so, because otherwise the enemies of the King would not give up that which they held in his kingdom; to fight against them thus, is she told them, one of the greatest benefits that can happen to all Christendom." **Article 18**

*Listening to the devil when attempting suicide*

16. "Jeanne, as one desperate, for hate and contempt of the English, and foreseeing the destruction of Compiègne, which she believed to be imminent [most likely to happen], did attempt to kill herself by throwing herself down from the top of a tower; at the instigation [provocation, encouragement] of the devil, she took it into her head to commit this action; she applied herself to commit it; she did commit it in so far as she was able; on the other hand, in so throwing herself down, she was so well impelled [forced] and guided by a diabolic [belonging to the devil] instinct that she had in view rather the safety of her body than that of her soul and of many others. Often indeed, had she boasted that she would kill herself rather than that she should be delivered to the English." **Article 41**

*Lying and possession by evil forces*

17. "Jeanne had not feared to proclaim that Saint Michael, the Archangel of God, did come to her with a great multitude [number] of Angels in the house of a woman where she had stopped at Chinon; that he walked with her, holding her by the hand; that they together mounted [climbed] the stairs of the Castle and together gained the Chamber of the King; that the Angel did reverence [feeling of deep respect] to the King, bowing before him, surrounded by this multitude of Angels, of which some had crowns on

their heads and others had wings. To say such things of Archangels and the Holy Angels is presumption [exceed what is proper], audacity [boldness], lying, as in the holy books we do not read that they did like a reverence, a like demonstration to any saint—not even to the Blessed Virgin, Mother of God...all these are lies imagined by Jeanne at the instigation of the devil, or suggested by demons in deceitful apparitions [visual appearance of spirits], to make sport of her curiosity, she who would search secrets beyond her capacity and condition." **Article 51**

*Manipulating the people to worship her*

18. "By all these inventions, Jeanne had so seduced [led astray] Christian people that many have in her presence adored her as a Saint, and in her absence do adore her still, composing [creating] in her honour masses and collects; yet more, going so far as to call her the greatest of all the Saints after the Virgin Mary, raising [putting up] statues and images to her in the Churches of the Saints, and bearing about them medals in lead or other metal representing her—exactly as the Church does to honour the memory and the recollection [remembrance] of the canonized Saints, publicly proclaiming [stating] that she is sent from God; and more Angel than woman. Such things are pernicious [harmful] to the Christian religion, scandalous, and prejudicial [harmful] to the salvation of souls." **Article 52**

*Forcing her leadership on the army*

19. "In contempt [feeling of one who views something as worthless] of the orders of God and the Saints, Jeanne, in her presumption [arrogance] and pride, had gone so far as to take command over men; she had made herself commander-in-chief and had under her orders nearly 16,000 men, among whom were Princes, Barons, and a number of Gentlemen; she had made them all fight, being their principal captain." **Article 53**

*Accusation of being a temptress*

20. "Jeanne did behave in an unseemly manner with men, refuses the society [company] of women, wishes to live with men only, to be waited up by them, even in her own room and in the most private details; a like thing had never been seen or heard of a chaste [pure] and pious [religious] woman." **Article 54**

## Positive comments about Joan

Joan's supporters were often from the following groups:

- peasants from the area surrounding her village;
- villagers and citizens whose towns Joan helped to free from the English;
- members of the clergy who gave sacraments to her or who examined her prior to her trial;
- knights and lords who fought beside her.

Their testimonies were heard at the Trial of Nullification twenty-five years after her initial trial, the Trial of Condemnation, where she was found guilty of witchcraft and heresy and was burned at the stake.

### *Joan's military leadership*

1. "It was said that Jeanne was as expert as possible in the art of ordering an army into battle, and that even a captain bred and instructed in war could not have shown more skill; at this the captains marveled exceedingly." **Maitre Aignan Viole (Licentiate in Law, Advocate of the Court of Parliament)**

### *Joan's ability as a military leader*

2. "In all she did, except in affairs of war, she was a very simple young girl; but for warlike things, bearing the lance, assembling an army, ordering military operations, directing artillery [weapons of war such as crossbows and siege equipment]—she was most skillful. Everyone wondered that she could act with as much wisdom and foresight as a captain who had fought for twenty or thirty years. It was above all in making use of artillery that she was so wonderful." **Jean (Duke d'Alençon)**

### *The injustices of Joan's trial*

3. "I know well that Jeanne has no director, Counsel, nor defender, up to the end of the Process [trial], and that no one would have dared to offer himself as her Counsel, director, or defender, for fear of the English. I have heard that those who went to the Castle to counsel and direct Jeanne, by order of the Judges, were harshly repulsed [spoken to] and threatened." **Brother Martin Ladvenu (priest)**

### *The English reaction to Joan*

4. "I think the English feared Jeanne more than the whole of the rest of the army of the King of France, and that this fear it was which moved them, in my opinion, to bring the Process against her."  
**Messire Pierce Lebouchier (Priest)**

### *The English motivation for Joan's death*

5. "Jeanne had done marvels in war, and, as the English are commonly superstitious, they thought there was a fate with her. Therefore, in my opinion, they, in all their counsels and elsewhere, desired her death."  
**Messire Thomas Marie (Priest)**

### *Joan's devotion*

6. "From her early youth, Jeannette was brought up with care in the Faith, and in good morals; she was so good that all the village of Domremy loved her. Jeannette knew her Belief and her Pater ["Our Father" in Latin; a prayer] and Ave ["The Ave Maria"; a prayer] as well as any of her companions. She had modest ways, as becomes one whose parents were not rich. Up to the time she left her parents she followed the plough and sometimes minded [looked after] the cattle in the fields. Also she did the usual duties of women, such as spinning, and other things. I know it pleased her to go often to the Hermitage of the Blessed Marie of Bermont [a convent], near Domremy. Often I saw her go there. She was there when her parents thought her with the plough or into the fields; and when she heard the Mass-bell, if she were in the fields, she would go back to the village and to the Church, in order to hear Mass..."  
**Jean Morel (labourer near Domremy)**

### *Joan's Christian values*

7. "She was a good and modest woman, living as a Catholic, very pious [religious], and when she could, never failing to be present at the Mass. To hear blasphemies [cursing or swearing in God's name] upon the Name of Our Lord vexed [annoyed] her. Many times when the Duke d'Alençon swore or blasphemed before her, I heard her reprove [express disappointment in] him. As a rule, no one in the army dared swear or blaspheme before her, for fear of being reprimanded." **Louis de Contes (Chamberlain to the Duke d'Orléans)**

*Joan's goodness*

8. "She was a girl of good disposition, devout [very committed to her faith], patient, loving the Church, going often to confession, and giving to the poor all that she could. I can attest this, having been witness thereof, both at Domremy and at my own house at Burey, where she passed [stayed] six weeks."  
**Durand Laxart (Joan's uncle)**

*Joan's commitment to her faith*

9. "When she was given over by the Church, I was still with her, and with great devotion she asked to have a Cross; and hearing this, an Englishman, who was there present, made a little cross of wood with the ends of a stick, which he gave her, and devoutly she received and kissed it, making piteous lamentations [sorrowful moans] and acknowledgements of God, Our Redeemer, Who had suffered on the Cross for our Redemption, of Whose Cross she had the sign and symbol; and she put the said Cross in her bosom [chest], between her person and her clothing. And, besides, she asked me humbly that I would get her the Church Cross, so that she might see it continually until death." **Maitre Jean Massieu (Priest)**

*Joan's ability to foresee the future*

10. "I saw Jeanne for the first time at Poitiers. And then she foretold [predicted] to us—to me and to all the others who were with me—these four things which should happen, and which did afterwards come to pass; first, that the English would be destroyed, the siege [attack] of Orléans raised, and the town delivered from the English; secondly that the King would be crowned at Reims; thirdly, that Paris would be restored to his dominion [rule]; and fourthly, that the Duke d'Orléans should be brought back from England. And I who speak, I have in truth seen these four things accomplished. We reported all this to the Council of the King; and we were of opinion that, considering the extreme necessity and the great peril [danger] of the town, the King might make use of her help and send her to Orléans."  
**Brother Séguin de Séguin (Dean of the Faculty of Theology of Poitiers)**

## Assessing the evidence

Use the following rubric to assess students' evidence supporting and countering each of Joan's character traits. Award intermediate marks for evidence falling between the descriptors.

|   | <b>Underdeveloped</b>   | <b>Competent</b>   | <b>Well developed</b>   |
|---|---|--|---|
| <b>Identification of character traits</b> | No plausible character traits are identified.<br><br><b>1</b>   | Three plausible character traits are identified.<br><br><b>3</b>   | Five or more plausible character traits are identified.<br><br><b>5</b>                               |
| <b>Supporting evidence</b>                | Virtually no relevant evidence is offered to support any of the character traits.<br><br><b>1</b>         | Approximately two pieces of relevant evidence are offered to support each character trait.<br><br><b>3</b>         | Four pieces of relevant evidence are offered to support each character trait.<br><br><b>5</b>         |
| <b>Counter-evidence</b>                   | Virtually no relevant counter-evidence is offered to support any of the character traits.<br><br><b>1</b> | Approximately two pieces of relevant counter-evidence are offered to support each character trait.<br><br><b>3</b> | Four pieces of relevant counter-evidence are offered to support each character trait.<br><br><b>5</b> |

**TOTAL****/ 15**

Comments: